Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION, HISTORICAL BACKGROUND, AND OVERVIEW OF ISSUES
§ 1:1 Chapter summary
§ 1:2 Introduction to the collateral consequences of conviction
§ 1:3 Historical background—Civil death in early America
§ 1:4 —Civil disabilities in the Age of Reform
§ 1:5 —Collateral penalties and the “War on Crime”
§ 1:6 —Restoration of rights and status in the 21st century
§ 1:7 Terminology
§ 1:8 —What is “collateral”?
§ 1:9 —What is a conviction?
§ 1:10 Legal consequences: Collateral sanctions and discretionary disqualification
§ 1:11 Reputational consequences: The stigma of conviction in the information age
§ 1:12 Opportunities and benefits affected
§ 1:13 Collateral consequences and the Constitution
§ 1:14 Limiting and mitigating collateral consequences
§ 1:15 Collateral consequences—Criminal practice
§ 1:16 —Civil practice
§ 1:17 Inter-jurisdictional issues
§ 1:18 Contemporary national law reform proposals

CHAPTER 2. TYPES OF COLLATERAL CONSEQUENCES
§ 2:1 Chapter summary
§ 2:2 Civil and political rights—Overview
§ 2:3 —Voting
§ 2:4 —Jury service
§ 2:5 —Public office
§ 2:6 —Community service
§ 2:7 —Enlisting in military service
§ 2:8 State and municipal employment and licensure
§ 2:9 Federal agency employment and licensure
§ 2:10 Federal regulation of state and private employment and licensure
§ 2:11 Transportation employment: land, sea, and air
§ 2:12 Federal procurement and financial assistance
§ 2:13  State and municipal procurement
§ 2:14  Government regulation of business
§ 2:15  Federal health care program debarment
§ 2:16  Federal food and drug program debarment
§ 2:17  Access to public housing and rental subsidies
§ 2:18  Welfare benefits
§ 2:19  Social security benefits
§ 2:20  Veterans’ benefits
§ 2:21  Government employee annuity and pension benefits
§ 2:22  Student financial aid and other educational consequences
§ 2:23  Drivers’ licenses
§ 2:24  Health care benefits
§ 2:25  Family-related consequences—Overview
§ 2:26  —Loss of parental preference in contested custody proceedings
§ 2:27  —The Adoption and Safe Families Act and termination of parental rights for incarcerated individuals
§ 2:28  —The Adam Walsh Child Protection and Safety Act and the absolute bar on foster parent certification
§ 2:29  Firearms restrictions—Overview
§ 2:30  —Federal firearms restrictions
§ 2:31  —Federal firearms restrictions: “crime punishable by imprisonment for a term exceeding one year”
§ 2:32  —Federal firearms restrictions: misdemeanor domestic violence
§ 2:33  —Exceptions to federal firearms restrictions
§ 2:34  —State firearms restrictions
§ 2:35  —Restoration of firearms privileges: relationship between state and federal dispossession laws
§ 2:36  —Second Amendment challenges to felony dispossession laws
§ 2:37  Body armor
§ 2:38  Sex offense-related collateral consequences—Overview
§ 2:39  —Registration and community notification
§ 2:40  —Constitutional challenges to registration and community notification laws: in general
§ 2:41  —Constitutional challenges to registration and community notification laws: coverage-based challenges
§ 2:42  —Constitutional challenges to registration and community notification laws: post-application challenges
§ 2:43  —Residence and visitation restrictions for sex offenders
§ 2:44  —Lifetime community supervision of sex offenders
**CHAPTER 2. INJUNCTIONS AND COLLATERAL CONSEQUENCES**

- § 2:45 Involuntary civil commitment
- § 2:46 Internet and social media bans and limits
- § 2:47 Immigration consequences—Introduction
- § 2:48 Relevance of immigration status
- § 2:49 Relevant agencies
- § 2:50 Types of consequences: inadmissibility
- § 2:51 Types of consequences: deportability
- § 2:52 Types of consequences: naturalization
- § 2:53 Types of consequences: detention
- § 2:54 Definition of “conviction” in immigration law
- § 2:55 Relevant categories of convictions
- § 2:56 Aggravated felonies
- § 2:57 Crimes involving moral turpitude
- § 2:58 Controlled substance offenses
- § 2:59 Contact with the criminal justice system
- § 2:60 No right to counsel in immigration proceedings
- § 2:61 Pardon waiver
- § 2:62 International travel restrictions—In general
- § 2:63 Canada
- § 2:64 Civil asset forfeiture
- § 2:65 Effect of conviction on subsequent civil litigation
- § 2:66 “Collateral” aspects of the sentence
- § 2:67 Future sentence enhancement
- § 2:68 Collateral consequences of juvenile adjudications—Overview
- § 2:69 Education consequences
- § 2:70 Use of juvenile records in employer background checks
- § 2:71 Immigration consequences
- § 2:72 Loss of driving privileges
- § 2:73 Effect on subsequent adult criminal proceedings
- § 2:74 Effect on military enlistment
- § 2:75 Public benefits and public housing
- § 2:76 Sex offender registration and notification
- § 2:77 Expungement and sealing of juvenile records
- § 2:78 Representation of juveniles
- § 2:79 Collateral consequences for corporations

**CHAPTER 3. CONSTITUTIONAL CHALLENGES**

- § 3:1 Constitutional challenges to collateral consequences, in general
- § 3:2 Challenges to government institutional authority, in general
§ 3:3 Challenges to federal congressional power—Commerce Clause and the Tenth Amendment
§ 3:4 Substantive challenges to federal congressional power—Necessary & Proper Clause
§ 3:5 Substantive challenges to legislative authority—Separation of powers and delegation of authority
§ 3:6 Substantive challenges based on rights guaranteed by the U.S Constitution—In general
§ 3:7 Substantive challenges based on rights guaranteed by the Constitution—Ex post facto laws
§ 3:8 —Freedom of speech
§ 3:9 —Freedom of association
§ 3:10 —Free exercise of religion
§ 3:11 —Right to bear arms
§ 3:12 —Unreasonable search or seizure
§ 3:13 —Takings
§ 3:14 —Cruel and unusual punishment
§ 3:15 —Excessive fines
§ 3:16 —Equal protection, generally
§ 3:17 —Equal protection: Disenfranchisement
§ 3:18 —Substantive due process
§ 3:19 —Antisubordination
§ 3:20 Procedural rights challenges—Generally
§ 3:21 —Procedural due process: right to a hearing
§ 3:22 —Due process: vagueness
§ 3:23 —Full Faith and Credit Clause
§ 3:24 Challenges to the validity of the underlying criminal conviction

CHAPTER 4. COLLATERAL CONSEQUENCES AND THE RIGHT TO COUNSEL
§ 4:1 Chapter summary
§ 4:2 Collateral consequences and the right to counsel before Padilla v. Kentucky
§ 4:3 Padilla v. Kentucky
§ 4:4 Ineffective assistance of counsel post-Padilla—In general
§ 4:5 —The competence prong
§ 4:6 —The competence prong—Duty to advise the client
§ 4:7 —The competence prong—Duty to advise about non-immigration collateral consequences
§ 4:8 —The prejudice prong
§ 4:9 Remedies for ineffective assistance in the plea process
Table of Contents

§ 4:10 Retroactivity of the Padilla decision
§ 4:11 Procedural bars to Padilla relief
§ 4:12 Judicial advisement post-Padilla
§ 4:13 —Due process advisement
§ 4:14 —Effect on right to effective assistance of counsel
§ 4:15 Collateral consequences and the right to counsel in misdemeanor cases

CHAPTER 5. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CRIMINAL RECORDS

A. OVERVIEW OF CRIMINAL RECORDS LAW AND POLICY IN THE 21ST CENTURY

§ 5:1 Scope of the challenge
§ 5:2 Trends in availability and use of criminal records
§ 5:3 American exceptionalism in criminal records
§ 5:4 What is a “criminal record”?  
§ 5:5 Legal framework governing dissemination of criminal record information
§ 5:6 Current trends in the availability of criminal records
§ 5:7 Reasons for increased availability of criminal records
§ 5:8 Availability of non-conviction information in criminal records
§ 5:9 Availability of juvenile criminal records
§ 5:10 Accuracy of criminal records—Sources of inaccuracy
§ 5:11 —Improving accuracy
§ 5:12 Identity theft and implications for criminal records
§ 5:13 Mitigating the negative consequences of a criminal record

B. REGULATION OF COMMERCIAL CRIMINAL HISTORY REPORTS UNDER THE FEDERAL FAIR CREDIT REPORTING ACT

§ 5:14 Application of the federal Fair Credit Reporting Act to commercial preparation of criminal background reports
§ 5:15 FCRA obligations of commercial preparers of criminal background reports—Generally
§ 5:16 —Obsolescence
§ 5:17 —Use of “reasonable procedures” to insure “maximum possible accuracy”
§ 5:18 —Types of errors found to be actionable
§ 5:19 —Employment reports
§ 5:20 —Reinvestigation and correction of disputed information
§ 5:21 —Full file disclosure
§ 5:22 FCRA obligations of users of criminal background reports—In general
§ 5:23 —Written disclosure and authorization
§ 5:24 —Pre-Adverse action notice
§ 5:25 —Adverse action notice
§ 5:26 Federal enforcement of FCRA’s obligations
§ 5:27 Private enforcement of FCRA’s obligations—Civil liability for FCRA violations
§ 5:28 —Federal court standing
§ 5:29 —Pleading and proving a claim
§ 5:30 —Willfulness
§ 5:31 —Statutes of limitations
§ 5:32 Claims against commercial preparers under state credit reporting statutes
§ 5:33 FCRA preemption of state claims

C. PROPOSALS TO IMPROVE CRIMINAL BACKGROUND CHECKS THROUGH NEW RULES OF ACCESS TO CRIMINAL JUSTICE INFORMATION REPOSITORIES

§ 5:34 The need for good sources of criminal history information
§ 5:35 Criminal history information sources—Commercial services
§ 5:36 —Criminal justice information repositories
§ 5:37 —Limited access to the FBI system
§ 5:38 —Value of national fingerprint checks
§ 5:39 Attorney General’s Report to Congress
§ 5:40 State central repositories
§ 5:41 FBI national repository—Next Generation Identification and III systems
§ 5:42 —Expungement or correction of records in IAFIS/III
§ 5:43 —Addressing the incomplete nature of III records
§ 5:44 Federal Record Improvement Grants
§ 5:45 Non-criminal justice checks of FBI criminal history information—In general
§ 5:46 The National Crime Prevention and Privacy Compact
§ 5:47 Expanded private sector access to the FBI records system—Limited current sources for private background checks
§ 5:48 —Advantages of using the FBI national system
CHAPTER 6. REGULATION OF EMPLOYMENT AND OCCUPATIONAL LICENSING

A. TITLE VII OF THE CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1964 AND CRIMINAL RECORDS

§ 6:1     Title VII—Introduction
§ 6:2     —Disparate impact challenges to employment practices
§ 6:3     —Covered employers
§ 6:4     —Applied to criminal records—Judicial interpretations
§ 6:5     ——2012 EEOC Enforcement Guidance
§ 6:6     Interaction of Title VII with other laws regulating consideration of criminal records in the workplace
§ 6:7     Federal enforcement of Title VII by the EEOC
§ 6:8     Private enforcement of Title VII
§ 6:9     Challenging criminal records policies under Title VII—In general
§ 6:10    —Administrative exhaustion
§ 6:11    —Litigation considerations
§ 6:12    ——Availability of data
§ 6:13    The future of Title VII challenges to criminal records policies

B. STATE LAWS LIMITING DISCRIMINATION BASED ON CONVICTION IN EMPLOYMENT AND LICENSURE

§ 6:14    Overview of state laws limiting discrimination based on conviction
§ 6:15    State fair employment practices laws applicable to conviction
§ 6:16    State law limitations on consideration of conviction in employment and licensing
§ 6:17    Ban-the-box and other systemic limits on inquiries about criminal records
C. NEGLIGENT HIRING LIABILITY FOR EMPLOYERS

§ 6:18 Negligent hiring—Negligent hiring suits and employment of persons with criminal records
§ 6:19 —A tortious act
§ 6:20 —Review of caselaw
§ 6:21 —Cases where negligence was found
§ 6:22 —Cases where negligence was not found
§ 6:23 —Employers’ Fear of Liability
§ 6:24 —Due diligence to reduce the risk of liability
§ 6:25 —Statutory presumptions against negligent hiring
§ 6:26 —Statutory limitation of evidence at trial
§ 6:27 —Reliance on certificates of rehabilitation as establishing due care
§ 6:28 —Need for uniformity in protection from liability
§ 6:29 —Conclusion

CHAPTER 7. RESTORATION OF RIGHTS AND STATUS AFTER CONVICTION

§ 7:1 Restoration of rights and status—Overview
§ 7:2 Typology of restoration mechanisms
§ 7:3 Legislative restoration of rights—Upon discharge from court-imposed sentence
§ 7:4 —Durational limits
§ 7:5 —Waiver, appeal, and other consequence-specific relief
§ 7:6 Executive pardon—Generally
§ 7:7 —Effect of a state pardon
§ 7:8 —Models for administration of the pardon power in the states
§ 7:9 —Models for administration of the pardon power in the states: independent board model
§ 7:10 —Administration of the pardon power in the states: power-sharing model
§ 7:11 —Administration of the pardon power in the states: optional consultation model
§ 7:12 —States with active pardoning programs
§ 7:13 —State pardon procedures
§ 7:14 —Presidential pardon process and standards
§ 7:15 —Effect of a presidential pardon
§ 7:16 Judicial restoration mechanisms—Generally
§ 7:17 —Expungement and sealing
§ 7:18 —Legal and policy objections to sealing and expungement
§ 7:19 —Expungement and sealing of juvenile records
## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 7:20</td>
<td>Expungement and sealing of non-conviction records</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7:21</td>
<td>Set-aside, vacatur, and annulment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7:22</td>
<td>Deferred adjudication and other diversionary dispositions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7:23</td>
<td>Certificates of rehabilitation and relief from disabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7:24</td>
<td>Interjurisdictional effect of relief mechanisms</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 8. PRACTICE ISSUES FOR THE CRIMINAL CASE: ADVOCACY AND ADMINISTRATION

| § 8:1   | Chapter summary |
| § 8:2   | Introduction to the issues |
| § 8:3   | Charging the defendant—Considerations for the prosecutor and defense counsel |
| § 8:4   | Interviewing the defendant—Considerations for defense counsel |
| § 8:5   | Negotiating a plea—In general |
| § 8:6   | —Considerations for the defense attorney |
| § 8:7   | —Considerations for the prosecutor |
| § 8:8   | —Considerations for the judge |
| § 8:9   | Counseling the defendant—In general |
| § 8:10  | —Considerations for the defense attorney |
| § 8:11  | —Considerations for the prosecutor |
| § 8:12  | —Considerations for the judge |
| § 8:13  | Pleading guilty—In general |
| § 8:14  | —Role of the prosecutor |
| § 8:15  | —Role of the judge |
| § 8:16  | Sentencing—In general |
| § 8:17  | —Considerations for the defense attorney |
| § 8:18  | —Considerations for the prosecutor |
| § 8:19  | —Considerations for the judge |
| § 8:20  | Appeals |
| § 8:21  | Collateral attack |
| § 8:22  | Restoring rights and status after conviction |
| § 8:23  | Resources for practitioners, judges, and defendants |

## CHAPTER 9. THE FUTURE OF COLLATERAL CONSEQUENCES

| § 9:1   | Chapter summary |
| § 9:2   | Second Chance Act and reentry resources |
| § 9:3   | Law reform initiatives—Overview |
| § 9:4   | —ABA Criminal Justice Standards |
| § 9:5   | —Uniform Collateral Consequences of Conviction Act |
§ 9:6 —Model Penal Code: Sentencing
§ 9:7 Compilations of collateral consequences
§ 9:8 State law reforms
§ 9:9 Making invisible punishments visible—Overview
§ 9:10 —Collecting collateral consequences
§ 9:11 ——Simplifying the data
§ 9:12 —Counseling the client
§ 9:13 —Legislative evaluation
§ 9:14 Charting the future of collateral consequences

APPENDICES


Appendix B-2. Uniform Collateral Consequences of Conviction Act (2010)

Appendix B-3. Model Penal Code: Sentencing (American Law Institute, 2017), Article 6 (selected sections on diversion)


Appendix B-5. Consideration of Arrest and Conviction Records Under Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 (EEOC 2012)

Appendix B-6. Model Collateral Consequences Occupational Licensing Act (Institute for Justice 2018)

Appendix B-7. Collateral Damage: America’s Failure to Forgive or Forget in the War on Crime (NACDL 2014) (“Executive Summary”)

Table of Laws and Rules
Table of Cases
Index