Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION

I. OVERVIEW
§ 1:1 Generally
§ 1:2 Basic legal protections: Asylum, INA § 241(b)(3) withholding of removal, and Convention Against Torture
§ 1:3 History of U.S. asylum law
§ 1:4 Current challenges

II. SOURCES OF LAW
§ 1:5 Domestic law
§ 1:6 International law

III. ASYLUM, WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL, AND CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE PROCEDURE
§ 1:7 Generally
§ 1:8 Credible fear and reasonable fear
§ 1:9 Asylum Office: “Affirmative” asylum
§ 1:10 Immigration Court: “Defensive” asylum, INA § 241(b)(3) withholding of removal, and protection under Convention Against Torture
§ 1:11 Administrative and judicial review
§ 1:12 Post-asylum: Family reunification and permanent residency

IV. RELATED IMMIGRATION STATUSES AND RELIEF
§ 1:13 Introduction
§ 1:14 Temporary protected status (TPS)
§ 1:15 Violence Against Women Act (VAWA)
§ 1:16 U and T visas
§ 1:17 Special immigrant juvenile status (SIJS)
§ 1:18 Deferred action, deferred action for childhood arrivals, and deferred action for parental accountability
§ 1:19 Private bills

CHAPTER 2. STANDARD OF PROOF

I. INTRODUCTION
§ 2:1 Generally

II. DISTINGUISHING STANDARDS OF PROOF IN ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL: EARLY U.S. SUPREME COURT DECISIONS
§ 2:2 Generally
III. STANDARD OF PROOF FOR ASYLUM

A. WELL-FOUNDED FEAR OF PERSECUTION

1. Overview

§ 2:3 Generally

§ 2:4 Requirement of individualized determination

2. “Subjective” and “Objective” Elements

§ 2:5 “Subjective” fear and “objective” risk

§ 2:6 Reconciling “subjective” fear and “objective” risk

3. Refugees “Sur Place”

§ 2:7 Generally

4. Types of Proof

§ 2:8 Past persecution

§ 2:9 Targeting: Threats and past harm

§ 2:10 Human rights conditions

§ 2:11 Treatment of closely-associated persons

§ 2:12 “Pattern or practice” (“similarly-situated” standard)

5. Internal Relocation

§ 2:13 Generally

§ 2:14 Burden of proof

§ 2:15 “Reasonableness” under all the circumstances

B. PAST PERSECUTION

1. Overview

§ 2:16 Past persecution: Independent basis

2. Burden Shifting and Exercise of Discretion

a. Presumption of Future Persecution

§ 2:17 Generally

b. Rebuttal of Presumption

i. Fundamental Change in Circumstances

§ 2:18 Fundamental change in circumstances generally

§ 2:19 Fundamental change in conditions of country of origin

§ 2:20 Fundamental change in personal circumstances—Gender and female genital mutilation

§ 2:21 Forced sterilization

ii. Internal Relocation

§ 2:22 Generally

iii. Discretionary Grant and “Past-Persecution-Only Asylum”

§ 2:23 Generally
IV. STANDARD OF PROOF IN INA § 241(b)(3) WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL

§ 2:26 Generally
§ 2:27 Withholding of removal based on past persecution
§ 2:28 Withholding of removal based on future threat to life or freedom

CHAPTER 3. EVIDENCE

I. INTRODUCTION

§ 3:1 Generally

II. APPLICANT'S BURDEN OF PROOF

A. OVERVIEW

§ 3:2 Generally
§ 3:3 Applicant’s testimony; benefit of the doubt principle

B. CORROBORATION

1. Overview

§ 3:4 Generally
§ 3:5 Corroboration of central, material facts that are reasonably available
§ 3:6 Judicial review: Scope of review and corroboration rules
§ 3:7 Notice and opportunity to respond

2. Types of Corroborating Evidence

a. Overview

§ 3:8 Generally
§ 3:9 Corroboration testimony of lay witnesses
§ 3:10 Expert witnesses and affidavits
§ 3:11 External documentary evidence

b. Country Conditions and Human Rights Documentation

§ 3:12 Generally
§ 3:13 Governmental and non-governmental sources

III. ADMINISTRATIVE NOTICE OF COUNTRY CONDITIONS

§ 3:14 Board of Immigration Appeals practice
§ 3:15 Commonly acknowledged facts requirement
§ 3:16 Applicant’s right to individualized determination
§ 3:17 Restrictions on adjudicative or outcome-determinative facts
§ 3:18 Rebuttal rights

IV. CREDIBILITY

A. OVERVIEW

§ 3:19 Generally
§ 3:20 REAL ID Act codification of credibility standards

B. CREDIBILITY FACTORS

1. Demeanor
§ 3:21 Generally

2. Specificity and Detail
§ 3:22 Generally

3. Consistency
§ 3:23 Generally
§ 3:24 Internal consistency
§ 3:25 Nonmaterial inconsistencies
§ 3:26 External consistency; corroboration

4. Applicant’s Opportunity to Explain
§ 3:27 Generally

5. Children and Credibility
§ 3:28 Generally

CHAPTER 4. PERSECUTION

I. PERSECUTION: DOMESTIC AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

§ 4:1 International law and human rights standards
§ 4:2 History and context
§ 4:3 Human rights standards
§ 4:4 U.S. case law: General concepts and definitions
§ 4:5 Persecution versus “threat to life or freedom”
§ 4:6 Distinguishing persecution from prosecution
§ 4:7 Persecution versus punishment

II. ROLE OF STATE PROTECTION

§ 4:8 State protection: Inability or unwillingness to protect
§ 4:9 State actors: Official and de facto
§ 4:10 Non-state actors
§ 4:11 Evidence of a failure of state protection

III. FORMS OF PERSECUTORY HARM

A. OVERVIEW
§ 4:12 Generally
B. PHYSICAL VIOLENCE AND RELATED HARMS

§ 4:13 Generally
§ 4:14 Detention
§ 4:15 Rape and sexual violence
§ 4:16 Domestic violence
§ 4:17 Female genital mutilation

C. MENTAL, EMOTIONAL, AND PSYCHOLOGICAL HARM

§ 4:18 Generally
§ 4:19 Threats
§ 4:20 Harm to family members
§ 4:21 Harm to children

D. FORCED VIOLATIONS OF FUNDAMENTAL BELIEFS

§ 4:22 Generally
§ 4:23 Forced renunciation or violation of religious beliefs
§ 4:24 Coercive family planning policies
§ 4:25 Feminist beliefs and forced marriage
§ 4:26 Conscription

E. ECONOMIC HARM

1. Overview

§ 4:27 Generally
§ 4:28 Evolution of standards

2. Forms of Economic Harm

§ 4:29 Generally
§ 4:30 Fines and other economic penalties
§ 4:31 Employment
§ 4:32 Housing and other means of living and support
§ 4:33 Education and health care

3. Cumulative Economic Harm

§ 4:34 Generally

F. DISCRIMINATION

§ 4:35 Generally

G. EXPULSION AND DENATIONALIZATION

§ 4:36 Generally
CHAPTER 5. NEXUS AND GROUNDS OF PERSECUTION

I. NEXUS REQUIREMENT
   A. OVERVIEW
      § 5:1 Generally
   B. INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS AND U.S. INTERPRETATION
      1. Overview
      § 5:2 Generally
      2. Early U.S. Interpretation of Nexus
         § 5:3 Early Board of Immigration Appeals decisions: Emphasis on motives
         § 5:4 Early Ninth Circuit presumptions
         § 5:5 U.S. Supreme Court in Elias-Zacarias: Rejection of per se rules, acceptance of circumstantial evidence
   C. PROVING NEXUS
      1. Overview
      § 5:6 Generally
      § 5:7 Evidence: Direct or circumstantial
      § 5:8 Mixed motives: Matter of S-P.
      § 5:9 Objective criteria: No subjective animus
      § 5:10 Laws of general applicability and enforcement
      2. REAL ID Act and Nexus: “At Least One Central Reason” Test
         § 5:11 Generally
         § 5:12 Legislative history: Change from “motive” to “reason”
         § 5:13 Mixed reasons; requirement of “non-tangential” reason
         § 5:14 Motivational inquiry post-REAL ID
         § 5:15 The bifurcated nexus challenge in U.S. law

II. GROUNDS OF PERSECUTION
   A. OVERVIEW
      § 5:16 Generally
   B. POLITICAL OPINION
      1. Overview
      § 5:17 Meaning of political opinion
      2. Express Political Opinion
      § 5:18 Organizational membership and affiliation
TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 5:19 Labor union membership and activities
§ 5:20 Mere membership in or association with a group
§ 5:21 Individual activism
§ 5:22 Refusal to join or support organization
§ 5:23 Whistleblowing
§ 5:24 Neutrality
§ 5:25 Third generation gangs
§ 5:26 Violation of the law, generally
§ 5:27 Violation of laws prohibiting departure
§ 5:28 Violation of military service laws
§ 5:29 Gender-related political opinion
§ 5:30 Opposition to, or violation of, coercive family planning laws

3. Imputed Political Opinion
   a. Overview
§ 5:31 Generally
   b. Imputation Based on Associations
§ 5:32 Family associations as a basis for imputed political opinion
§ 5:33 Nationality, race, religion, or ethnic group as a basis for imputed political opinion
§ 5:34 Village or region as a basis for imputed political opinion
§ 5:35 Social class as a basis for imputed political opinion
§ 5:36 Perceived group membership or association with group members as a basis for imputed political opinion
§ 5:37 Spiritual, philosophical, or charitable practices or group membership as basis for imputed political opinion
§ 5:38 Individual ties to government, actual and perceived, as a basis for imputed political opinion
   c. Non-Associational Activism
§ 5:39 Generally

C. MEMBERSHIP IN A PARTICULAR SOCIAL GROUP
   1. Basic Framework
§ 5:40 Generally
   2. Social Distinction and Particularity
§ 5:41 Generally
§ 5:42 Evolution of PSG
§ 5:43 The requirements of particularity and social distinction
   3. Types of Social Group Claims
      a. Family and Clan
§ 5:44 Generally
b. Gender-Based Particular Social Groups
   i. Overview
   § 5:45 Gender Per Se
   ii. Female Genital Mutilation
       § 5:46 Generally
       § 5:47 Past female genital mutilation
       § 5:48 Fear of harm to applicant’s children
       iii. Spousal or Intimate Partner Violence
       § 5:49 Generally
   iv. Forced Marriage
       § 5:50 Generally
   v. Trafficking
       § 5:51 Generally
   vi. Gender-Based Discrimination
       § 5:52 Generally
   c. Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity
       § 5:53 Sexual orientation
       § 5:54 Gender identity
   d. Third Generation Gangs
      i. Overview
      § 5:55 Generally
      ii. Former Gang Members
      § 5:56 Generally
      iii. Non-Gang Members
      § 5:57 Generally
      § 5:58 Resistance to recruitment
      § 5:59 Extortion
      § 5:60 Witnesses or informants
      § 5:61 Gender-based
      e. Children
      § 5:62 Generally
   f. Former Status
      § 5:63 Generally
      § 5:64 Past targeting and victimization
      § 5:65 Social status
      g. Health Status and Disability
      § 5:66 Generally
      § 5:67 HIV/AIDS
D. RELIGION

1. Overview

§ 5:68 Generally
§ 5:69 Right to religious freedom in international law
§ 5:70 Defining religion

2. Right to Hold Religious Beliefs

§ 5:71 Generally

3. Right to Practice: Restrictions on the Exercise of Religious Freedom

§ 5:72 Generally
§ 5:73 State regulation of religion
§ 5:74 Religion-based conscientious objectors

4. Sincerity of Belief and Evidentiary Issues

§ 5:75 Generally
§ 5:76 Doctrinal religious knowledge
§ 5:77 Apostasy
§ 5:78 Perceived renunciation

5. Well-Founded Fear and Nexus Issues

§ 5:79 Generally

6. Relationship of Religion to Other Grounds

§ 5:80 Religion and political opinion
§ 5:81 Religion and gender
§ 5:82 Religion and race, nationality
§ 5:83 Interfaith marriages

E. RACE

§ 5:84 Generally
§ 5:85 Racial discrimination
§ 5:86 Standard of proof and nexus
§ 5:87 Relationship of race to other grounds

F. NATIONALITY

§ 5:88 Generally
§ 5:89 Relationship of nationality to other grounds
§ 5:90 Perceived nationality

CHAPTER 6. INELIGIBILITY FOR ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL

I. INTRODUCTION

§ 6:1 International basis for exclusion from refugee status
§ 6:2 Bars, generally
II. BARS TO ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL

A. PERSECUTION OF OTHERS

§ 6:3 Generally
§ 6:4 Comparison between U.S. provisions and Refugee Convention
§ 6:5 Development of U.S. case law
§ 6:6 Persecution on account of a protected ground
§ 6:7 “Ordered, incited, assisted, or otherwise participated in” requirement

B. SERIOUS NONPOLITICAL CRIMES

§ 6:8 Generally
§ 6:9 “Serious reasons for believing” requirement
§ 6:10 “Nonpolitical” crime requirement
§ 6:11 Terrorism and “nonpolitical” crimes
§ 6:12 “Serious” crime requirement
§ 6:13 Balancing of criminal conduct and feared persecution

C. PARTICULARLY SERIOUS CRIMES

1. Overview

§ 6:14 Generally
§ 6:15 Issues of proof, individualized review, and categorical bars

2. The “Particularly Serious Crime” Bar to Asylum and Withholding of Removal

§ 6:16 Background
§ 6:17 Aggravated felonies: Particularly serious crimes per se
§ 6:18 Other per se or presumptive particularly serious crimes
§ 6:19 Crimes requiring individualized assessments
§ 6:20 “Danger to the community” and balancing severity of persecution

D. DANGER TO THE SECURITY OF THE UNITED STATES AND TERRORISM

1. Overview

§ 6:21 Generally
§ 6:22 U.S. and international law

2. “Danger to the Security of the United States”

§ 6:23 Generally

3. Terrorist Activities, Risks, and Associations

§ 6:24 Generally
§ 6:25 Key statutory definitions
§ 6:26 Operation of terrorism bars
§ 6:27 Material support of terrorism
§ 6:28 Waiver of terrorism-related bars

xxx
§ 6:29 Secret evidence

III. BARS TO ASYLUM ONLY

A. OVERVIEW

§ 6:30 Generally

B. ONE-YEAR FILING DEADLINE
   1. Overview
      § 6:31 Generally
      § 6:32 Timeliness: Burden and standard of proof
      § 6:33 Determining time of filing and time of entry
   2. Exceptions to One-Year Filing Deadline
      § 6:34 Generally
      § 6:35 Extraordinary circumstances
      § 6:36 Changed circumstances
      § 6:37 Reasonable period filing requirement

C. FIRM RESETTLEMENT
   § 6:38 Generally
   § 6:39 Burden of proof and evidence
   § 6:40 Status in third country
   § 6:41 Ability to return and status

D. DISCRETIONARY DENIALS OF ASYLUM
   § 6:42 Generally

E. SAFE THIRD-COUNTRY AGREEMENTS
   § 6:43 Generally
   § 6:44 U.S. safe third-country provisions

F. PREVIOUSLY-DENIED ASYLUM APPLICATIONS
   § 6:45 Generally

G. “FRIVOLOUS” ASYLUM APPLICATIONS
   § 6:46 Generally

IV. JUDICIAL REVIEW OF ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING BARS
   § 6:47 Generally
CHAPTER 7. PROTECTION UNDER ARTICLE 3 OF THE CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE

I. OVERVIEW
   A. CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE AND THE ABSOLUTE NATURE OF THE TORTURE PROHIBITION
      § 7:1 Generally
      § 7:2 U.S. obligations under the treaty; 1999 implementing regulations
   B. ARTICLE 3 OF THE CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE: PROHIBITION AGAINST RETURN
      § 7:3 Generally
      § 7:4 Contrast with asylum and withholding protections

II. SOURCES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW ON TORTURE
   A. OVERVIEW
      § 7:5 Generally
      § 7:6 European law
   B. EUROPEAN CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS
      § 7:7 Background to the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
      § 7:8 Importance and weight of European jurisprudence
      § 7:9 A brief comparison between Article 3 of the European Convention and Article 3 of the Torture Convention
      § 7:10 Individualization of risk
   C. U.N. HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE
      § 7:11 Monitoring compliance under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
   D. U.N. COMMITTEE AGAINST TORTURE
      § 7:12 Committee functions
   E. U.N. SPECIAL RAPPORTEUR ON TORTURE
      § 7:13 Appointment of the Special Rapporteur on Torture
   F. INTER-AMERICAN CONVENTION TO PREVENT AND PUNISH TORTURE, AND AMERICAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS
      § 7:14 Monitoring compliance under the American Convention
III. ARTICLE 3 CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE PROTECTION: U.S. AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

A. OVERVIEW
§ 7:15 Scope of Article 3: Torture only
§ 7:16 Interpretation and agreed-upon catalog of torturous acts
§ 7:17 Flexible interpretation
§ 7:18 Distinction between torture and other forms of inhuman or degrading treatment

B. ELEMENTS OF TORTURE
1. Overview
§ 7:19 Generally
2. Severe Physical or Mental Pain or Suffering
§ 7:20 Severe physical pain or suffering
§ 7:21 Detention and imprisonment
§ 7:22 Rape and other gender-based violence
§ 7:23 Severe mental pain or suffering
§ 7:24 Death penalty
3. Intentional Acts
§ 7:25 Generally
§ 7:26 Specific versus general intent
4. Proscribed Purpose
§ 7:27 Illicit purpose
5. Public Authority: Instigation, Consent, or Acquiescence
§ 7:28 Generally
§ 7:29 Scope of state authority
§ 7:30 Quasi-public officials
§ 7:31 Actions under color of law
§ 7:32 Domestic and gender violence: Issue of state complicity or acquiescence
§ 7:33 U.S. understanding of acquiescence
6. Exclusion of Lawful Sanctions
§ 7:34 Acts “arising only from, inherent in, or incidental to lawful sanctions”

C. STANDARD OF PROOF
1. Overview
§ 7:35 Generally
§ 7:36 Past torture as presumptive proof
2. The “Substantial Grounds Test” Under the Torture Convention
§ 7:37 Generally
§ 7:38 U.S. understanding of “substantial grounds”: Probability test
§ 7:39 European interpretations of standard of proof

3. Meeting the Standard of Proof

§ 7:40 Individual circumstances and treatment of “similarly situated” persons
§ 7:41 Consistent pattern of gross human rights violations
§ 7:42 Human rights evidence; changed country conditions
§ 7:43 Credibility and benefit of the doubt

D. NON-DEROGABILITY: NO EXCLUSION FROM PROTECTION

§ 7:44 Generally

E. ALL MEANS OF RETURN

§ 7:45 Generally

APPENDIX

Appendix A. Overview of Procedures for Asylum, Withholding of Removal, and Deferral of Removal

Table of Laws and Rules
Table of Cases
Index