# Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1 AN INTRODUCTION TO THE LAW OF TORTS.............1
1. Tort Law Defined.........................................................1
   Notes.............................................................................2
2. Tort and Contract .........................................................3
   Notes.............................................................................5
   Review Problem..........................................................5
3. A Brief History of Tort Law ........................................6
   Notes.............................................................................8
4. Trespass and Case: A Brief Review of the Case Law ......9
   *Scott v. Shepherd* .......................................................9
   Notes and Questions....................................................12
   *Leame v. Bray* ............................................................13
   *Williams v. Holland* ..................................................13
   Notes and Questions....................................................14
   *Holmes v. Mather* .......................................................14
   Notes and Questions....................................................16
   *Cook v. Lewis* .............................................................16
   Notes and Questions....................................................17
5. The Bases for Imposing Liability in Tort....................18
   (a) Absolute Liability .....................................................18
   (b) Strict Liability .........................................................18
   (c) Negligence .............................................................19
   (d) Intention....................................................................19
   (e) No Liability............................................................19
6. The Functions of Tort Law..........................................20
   (a) Compensation..........................................................21
   (b) Appeasement and Vindication....................................21
   (c) Punishment.............................................................22
   (d) Deterrence .............................................................22
   (e) Market Deterrence...................................................22
   (f) Justice .....................................................................23
   Notes and Questions....................................................23
7. The Rights Theory of Tort Law.................................25
   Notes and Questions....................................................27

CHAPTER 2 THE BASIC CONCEPTS OF REMEDIES IN
INTENTIONAL TORTS......................................................29
1. Introduction ...............................................................29
2. Judicial and Extrajudicial Remedies............................29
   Notes.............................................................................30
3. Classifications of Damages............................................31
   Note..............................................................................32
4. Nominal Damages.......................................................32
   *The Mediana* .............................................................32
   Notes and Questions....................................................33
5. Compensatory Damages.............................................34
(a) Assessing Damages for Pecuniary Losses ................. 34
The Mediana.............................................................. 34
Notes and Questions................................................. 35
(b) Assessing Damages for Non-Pecuniary Losses ......... 36
Review Problem....................................................... 36
6. Aggravated Damages .............................................. 37
Notes and Questions.................................................. 37
7. Punitive Damages .................................................. 38
Notes and Questions.................................................. 39
B. (P.) v. B. (W.) ........................................................ 39
Notes and Questions.................................................. 41
(a) The Principles in Whiten v. Pilot .............................. 43
Notes and Questions.................................................. 44
8. Disgorgement Damages ............................................. 45
(a) True Restitution for Unjust Enrichment .................. 46
(b) “Restitution” for “Unjust Enrichment” .................... 47
Notes and Questions.................................................. 47
Penarth Dock Engineering Co. Ltd. v. Pounds............ 47
Notes and Questions.................................................. 48
Review Problem.......................................................... 49

CHAPTER 3 INTENTIONAL INTERFERENCE WITH THE
PERSON............................................................................. 51
1. Introduction .................................................................. 51
2. Basic Principles of Liability ...................................... 51
(a) Volition .................................................................... 51
Smith v. Stone............................................................. 52
Notes and Questions..................................................... 52
(b) Intent ....................................................................... 52
(i) Imputed (Constructive) Intent ............................... 53
(ii) Transferred Intent ................................................. 53
Notes and Questions..................................................... 53
3. Related Issues: Motive, Mistake and Accident .......... 55
(a) Motive ..................................................................... 55
Notes............................................................................. 55
(i) Duress ..................................................................... 55
Gilbert v. Stone............................................................ 55
Notes and Questions..................................................... 56
(ii) Provocation ............................................................ 57
Miska v. Sivec............................................................... 57
Notes and Questions..................................................... 58
(b) Mistake ................................................................... 59
Hodgkinson v. Martin.................................................... 59
Ranson v. Kitner........................................................... 60
Notes and Questions..................................................... 60
(c) Accident ................................................................... 61
Review Problems .......................................................... 61
(d) The Liability of Children and Those with a Mental
Illness............................................................................. 62
4. Battery ................................................................. 63
   Notes and Questions........................................... 64
   Bettel v. Yim......................................................... 64
   Notes and Questions........................................... 67

5. Assault............................................................... 70
   Notes and Questions........................................... 70
   Holcombe v. Whitaker........................................... 71
   Police v. Greaves.................................................. 72
   Notes and Questions........................................... 73
   Review Problems ................................................. 75

6. False Imprisonment ............................................... 75
   Bird v. Jones ....................................................... 75
   Notes and Questions........................................... 77
   (a) False Arrest.................................................... 78
   Campbell v. S.S. Kresge Co.................................... 79
   Notes and Questions........................................... 80
   (b) Consensual Restraint ....................................... 82
   Herd v. Weardale Steel, Coal and Coke Co. Ltd .......... 82
   Notes and Questions........................................... 84
   Review Problem................................................... 84

7. Malicious Prosecution........................................... 84
   Nelles v. Ontario.................................................... 85
   Notes and Questions........................................... 88
   (a) The Tort of Abuse of Process .............................. 92
   Notes and Questions........................................... 93
   Review Problem................................................... 93

8. Intentional Infliction of Nervous Shock (Mental
   Distress, Psychiatric Harm)..................................... 94
   Wilkinson v. Downton........................................... 94
   Notes and Questions........................................... 96
   Radovskis v. Tomm................................................. 96
   Samms v. Eccles.................................................... 97
   Notes and Questions........................................... 99
   (a) Broadening of Liability .................................... 100
   Notes and Questions........................................... 100
   (b) The Innominate Intentional Tort ........................ 103
   Notes and Questions........................................... 103
   Review Problems ................................................. 104

9. Invasion of Privacy............................................... 105
   (a) Introduction ................................................... 105
   Motherwell v. Motherwell..................................... 105
   Notes and Questions........................................... 107
   (b) The American Common Law Privacy Actions ...... 108
   Notes and Questions........................................... 108
   (c) Emerging Common Law Privacy Actions in
       Canada............................................................. 109
   Notes and Questions........................................... 109
(d) Established Common Law Tort Actions in Canada

Jones v. Tsige ............................................................... 113
Notes and Questions .................................................... 115
(e) The Statutory Protection of Privacy ........................... 117
Notes and Questions .................................................... 118
(f) The Provincial Privacy Statutes ................................. 118
Hollinsworth v. BCTV .................................................. 118
Notes and Questions .................................................... 120
Review Problem ........................................................... 121
(g) Breach of Confidence ............................................. 121
Notes and Questions .................................................... 122
Review Problem ........................................................... 123
10. Discrimination ....................................................... 124
Seneca College of Applied Arts & Technology v. Bhadauria ......................................................... 124
Notes and Questions .................................................... 126

CHAPTER 4 INTENTIONAL INTERFERENCE WITH CHATTELS ......................................................... 129
1. Introduction ........................................................... 129
2. The Development of the Actions ................................ 129
   (a) Trespass ................................................................ 129
   (b) Detinue .............................................................. 130
   (c) Trover and Conversion ......................................... 131
       Notes and Questions ................................................ 133
3. Trespass to Chattels ............................................... 135
Fouldes v. Willoughby ................................................. 135
Notes and Questions .................................................... 137
4. Conversion ............................................................. 139
   (a) General Principles .............................................. 139
       Mackenzie v. Scotia Lumber Co. ............................. 139
       Notes and Questions ................................................ 141
       Review Problems .................................................... 148
   (b) Conversion of Cheques and Other Unusual Chattels ......................................................... 149
       373409 Alberta Ltd. (Receiver of) v. Bank of Montreal ......................................................... 149
       Notes and Questions ................................................ 152
       (c) Remedies for Conversion ................................... 158
           Aitken v. Gardiner .............................................. 158
           Notes and Questions ................................................ 160
5. Detinue ................................................................. 165
Gen. & Finance Facilities Ltd. v. Cooks Cars
   (Romford) Ltd. ........................................................... 165
Aitken v. Gardiner ......................................................... 167
Notes and Questions .................................................... 168
6. Recaption and Replevin ............................................. 171
   (a) Recaption .......................................................... 171
**CHAPTER 5**

INTENTIONAL INTERFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY .......................... 177

1. **Trespass to Land** .......................................................... 177  
   *Entick v. Carrington* ..................................................... 177  
   *Turner v. Thorne* .......................................................... 177  
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 179  
   Review Problems ......................................................... 182  
   *Harrison v. Carswell* .................................................... 182  
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 186  

2. **Trespass and Nuisance** .............................................. 189  
   *Kerr v. Revelstoke Bldg. Materials Ltd.* ........................ 190  
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 191  
   Review Problem ........................................................... 193  

3. **Trespass to Airspace and Subsoil** .................................. 194  
   (a) *Trespass to Airspace* .............................................. 194  
   *Bernstein v. Skyviews & General Ltd.* ............................ 194  
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 196  
   (b) *Trespass to Subsoil* ................................................. 197  
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 198  
   Review Problems ......................................................... 198  

**CHAPTER 6**

THE DEFENCE OF CONSENT ................................................... 201

1. **Introduction to the Defences** ....................................... 201  
2. **General Principles of Consent** ..................................... 201  
   (a) *Introduction* .......................................................... 201  
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 202  
   (b) *Implied Consent* ..................................................... 202  
   *Wright v. McLean* ........................................................ 202  
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 204  
   (c) *Exceeding Consent* .................................................. 204  
   *Agar v. Canning* ........................................................... 204  
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 205  
   Review Problems ......................................................... 208  
   (d) *Competency to Consent* .......................................... 208  

3. **Factors Vitiating Consent: Fraud, Mistake, Duress, and Public Policy** ......................................................... 209  
   (a) *Introduction* .......................................................... 209  
   (b) *Fraud (Deceit)* ....................................................... 209  
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 210  
   Review Problems ......................................................... 212  
   (c) *Mistake* ................................................................. 212  
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 212  
   Review Problems ......................................................... 213  
   (d) *Duress (Coercion)* .................................................. 213  
   *Latter v. Braddell* ....................................................... 213
4. Consent to Criminal or Immoral Acts .................................................... 220
    Notes and Questions ........................................................................ 220
5. Consent to Treatment, Counselling and Care .................................. 222
    (a) General Principles of Consent ............................................... 222
        Notes and Questions ................................................................ 222
    (b) Exceptions to the Common Law Principles of Consent ............ 223
        Marshall v. Curry .................................................................. 224
        Malette v. Shulman .................................................................. 226
        Notes and Questions ................................................................ 228
    (c) The Burden of Proof and Consent Forms ................................. 230
        Notes and Questions ................................................................ 230
    (d) Competency to Consent ......................................................... 231
        (i) Minors ......................................................................... 231
            C. v. Wren ....................................................................... 232
            Notes and Questions ........................................................ 234
        (ii) Adults ......................................................................... 236
            Notes and Questions ........................................................ 236
    (e) Substitute Consent to Treatment .............................................. 238
        Notes and Questions ................................................................ 238
    (f) Informed Consent: Battery or Negligence? ............................... 242
        Notes .................................................................................. 242
        Review Problem ...................................................................... 242

CHAPTER 7 DEFENCES RELATED TO THE PROTECTION OF PERSON AND PROPERTY ............................................ 245
1. Introduction .................................................................................. 245
2. Self-Defence .............................................................................. 245
    Wackett v. Calder ....................................................................... 245
    Notes and Questions .................................................................... 247
3. Defence of Third Parties ............................................................... 251
    Gambriell v. Caparelli .................................................................. 251
    Notes and Questions .................................................................... 253
4. Discipline .................................................................................... 254
    R. v. Dupperon .......................................................................... 254
    Notes and Questions .................................................................... 256
5. Defence of Real Property ............................................................. 259
    MacDonald v. Hees ..................................................................... 259
    Notes and Questions .................................................................... 261
    Bird v. Holbrook ........................................................................ 263
    Notes and Questions .................................................................... 264
6. Defence and Recaption of Chattels ............................................... 264
    Notes and Questions .................................................................... 265
    Review Problem .......................................................................... 266
7. Public and Private Necessity ................................................................. 266
   (a) Public Necessity .............................................................................. 266
       Surocco v. Geary .............................................................................. 266
       Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 268
   (b) Private Necessity ........................................................................... 270
       Vincent v. Lake Erie Tpt. Co. ............................................................ 270
       Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 273
8. Apportionment of Fault in Intentional Torts ........................................ 274
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................... 275
   Review Problems .................................................................................. 277

CHAPTER 8 THE DEFENCE OF LEGAL AUTHORITY .................................. 279
1. Introduction ......................................................................................... 279
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................... 280
2. The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms ................................... 281
   (a) Liability Under Section 24(1) .......................................................... 282
   (b) The Impact of Section 52 on the Defence of Legal Authority .......... 283
       Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 283
3. Authority and Privilege to Arrest Without a Warrant ......................... 285
   (a) Introduction .................................................................................... 285
       Notes ................................................................................................. 286
   (b) A Peace Officer’s Power to Arrest without a Warrant ..................... 286
       Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 287
   (c) Privilege or Justification Under the Criminal Code ......................... 288
       Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 289
   (d) A Private Citizen’s Authority and Privilege to Arrest without a Warrant 290
       Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 291
4. Rights and Obligations in the Arrest Process ........................................ 294
   (a) Reasons for the Arrest .................................................................... 294
       Koechlin v. Waugh and Hamilton ...................................................... 294
       Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 297
   (b) The Use of Reasonable Force .......................................................... 299
       Notes and Questions ......................................................................... 299
5. The Common Law Power to Search Pursuant to a Lawful Arrest .......... 301
   R. v. Caslake .......................................................................................... 301
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................... 303
6. A Peace Officer’s Common Law Power of Entry to Search for a Wanted Person ........................................ 308
   Eccles v. Bourque .................................................................................. 308
   Notes and Questions ........................................................................... 311
   Review Problems .................................................................................. 314

CHAPTER 9 INTRODUCTION TO THE LAW OF NEGLIGENCE .............. 317
1. Negligence: Defining Terms ................................................................. 317
2. The Historical Development of Negligence ................................. 317
   Notes and Questions.................................................................. 319
3. The Elements of a Negligence Action ........................................ 320
   (a) Introduction ...................................................................... 320
       (i) Duty of Care .................................................................. 321
       (ii) The Standard of Care and its Breach ......................... 321
       (iii) Causation .................................................................. 321
       (iv) Remoteness of Damages .......................................... 321
       (v) Actual Loss .................................................................. 321
       (vi) Defences .................................................................. 322
   Notes and Questions.................................................................. 322
   (b) Negligence: A Case Illustration ....................................... 322
       Dunsmore v. Deshield ...................................................... 323
   Notes and Questions.................................................................. 325

CHAPTER 10 THE DUTY OF CARE ................................................. 327
1. Evolution of the Duty of Care Test ............................................. 327
   (a) The Classical Approach .................................................. 327
   (b) The General Duty of Care Test ....................................... 328
       M’Alister (or Donoghue) v. Stevenson ................................ 328
       Notes and Questions.......................................................... 332
   (c) The Development of the Modern Law of Duty.................. 334
       Notes and Questions.......................................................... 336
   (d) Anns and the Supreme Court of Canada ......................... 337
       Cooper v. Hobart .............................................................. 338
       Notes and Questions.......................................................... 343
   (e) Developments Since Cooper v. Hobart ......................... 345
       Notes and Questions.......................................................... 348
2. Reasonable Foreseeability ......................................................... 349
   (a) Foreseeable Risk of Injury .............................................. 350
       Moule v. N.B. Elec. Power Comm. ................................... 350
       Amos v. N.B. Elec. Power Comm...................................... 351
       Rankin (Rankin’s Garage & Sales) v. J.J. ......................... 354
       Notes and Questions.......................................................... 357
   (b) Foreseeable Plaintiff ....................................................... 359
       Palsgraf v. Long Island Ry. Co. ........................................ 359
       Notes and Questions.......................................................... 362

CHAPTER 11 SPECIAL DUTIES OF CARE: AFFIRMATIVE
   ACTION ................................................................................. 367
1. Introduction to Special Duties of Care ....................................... 367
2. Introduction to Duties of Affirmative Action .............................. 367
   Notes and Questions.............................................................. 368
3. The Duty to Rescue .................................................................. 370
   Osterlind v. Hill ................................................................. 370
   Notes and Questions.............................................................. 371
   Matthews v. MacLaren; Horsley v. MacLaren ....................... 373
   Notes and Questions.............................................................. 378
   Good Samaritan Act, 2001 (Ontario) .................................... 382
4. The Duty to Control the Conduct of Others ........................................... 383
   (a) Liability for the Intoxicated .......................................................... 383
       *Crocker v. Sundance Northwest Resorts Ltd.* .......................... 383
       Notes and Questions .................................................................. 387
   (b) Other Duty to Control Situations .............................................. 393
       Notes and Questions .................................................................. 393
   (c) The Duty to Prevent Crime and Protect Others .................. 398
       *Jane Doe v. Metropolitan Toronto (Municipality)* 
       Commissioners of Police ......................................................... 398
       Notes and Questions .................................................................. 401
   Review Problems ........................................................................... 409

5. The Duty to Perform Gratuitous Undertakings .................................. 410
   Notes and Questions ...................................................................... 410
   *Smith v. Rae* ............................................................................. 412
   *Zelenko v. Gimbel Bros., Inc.* .................................................. 412
   *Soulsby v. Toronto* .................................................................. 413
   Notes and Questions ...................................................................... 414
   Review Problems ........................................................................... 416

CHAPTER 12 SPECIAL DUTIES OF CARE: MISCELLANEOUS

1. Introduction ..................................................................................... 417

2. The Duty of Care Owed to Rescuers .............................................. 417
   *Horsley v. MacLaren* .................................................................. 418
   Notes and Questions ...................................................................... 422
   Review Problems ............................................................................ 427

3. Duties Owed to the Unborn ............................................................ 427
   (a) Pre-Conception Wrongs ............................................................ 427
       Notes and Questions .................................................................. 428
   (b) Wrongful Birth and Wrongful Life ......................................... 430
       *Bovingdon (Litigation Guardian of) v. Hergott* ....................... 430
       Notes and Questions .................................................................. 435
   (c) Wrongful Pregnancy ................................................................. 437
       Notes and Questions .................................................................. 439
   (d) Pre-Natal Injuries .................................................................... 442
       Notes and Questions .................................................................. 444

4. Psychiatric Harm ............................................................................. 448
   (a) Introduction ............................................................................. 448
       Notes and Questions .................................................................. 449
   (b) Commonwealth Developments ............................................. 451
       *Alcock v. Chief Constable of South Yorkshire Police* .......... 453
       Notes and Questions .................................................................. 458
   (c) The Canadian Position ............................................................. 461
       *Saadati v. Moorhead* ............................................................... 462
       Notes and Questions .................................................................. 467
   Review Problem ............................................................................. 469

5. A Health Professional’s Duty to Inform ......................................... 469
   *Haughian v. Paine* ..................................................................... 470
CHAPTER 13 SPECIAL DUTIES OF CARE: NEGLIGENT MISREPRESENTATION

1. Introduction ................................................................. 497
   Notes and Questions.................................................... 499
2. Negligent Misrepresentation Causing Pure Economic Loss........................................ 505
   Deloitte & Touche v. Livent Inc. .................................. 505
   Notes and Questions.................................................... 518
   R. v. Imperial Tobacco Canada Ltd. ............................... 521
   Notes and Questions.................................................... 527
3. Negligent Misrepresentation and Contract ............................................... 527
   (a) Concurrent Liability in Tort and Contract..................... 528
   BG Checo International Ltd. v. B.C. Hydro & Power Authority ........................................ 528
   Notes and Questions.................................................... 534
   (b) Pre-Contractual Misrepresentations ..................... 535
   Queen v. Cognos Inc.................................................... 535
   Notes and Questions.................................................... 539
   Review Problem........................................................... 541

CHAPTER 14 SPECIAL DUTIES OF CARE: RECOVERY OF PURE ECONOMIC LOSS IN NEGLIGENCE

1. Introduction ................................................................. 543
   Notes and Questions.................................................... 544
2. New Categories of Pure Economic Loss ........................................ 544
   Martel Building Ltd. v. Canada .................................. 545
   Notes and Questions.................................................... 549
3. Negligent Performance of a Service ........................................ 554
   B.D.C. Ltd. v. Hofstran Farms Ltd. ................................ 554
   James v. British Columbia .......................................... 556
   Notes and Questions.................................................... 557
4. Negligent Supply of Shoddy Goods or Structures ........................................ 559
   Winnipeg Condominium Corp. No. 36 v. Bird Construction Co. ........................................ 559
   Notes and Questions.................................................... 565
   Review Problems........................................................... 570
5. Relational Economic Loss .................................................. 572
   Bow Valley Husky (Bermuda) Ltd. v. Saint John Shipbuilding Ltd. ........................................ 572
CHAPTER 15 THE STANDARD OF CARE .......................................... 583

1. Introduction ................................................................. 583

2. The Common Law Standard of Care: The Reasonable Person Test ................................. 585
   Arland v. Taylor ........................................................... 585
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 586

3. Factors Considered in Determining Breach of the Standard of Care .............................. 588
   (a) Probability and Severity of the Harm .................... 589
       Bolton v. Stone ............................................................. 589
       Paris v. Stepney Borough Council ................................. 591
       Notes and Questions .................................................... 594
   (b) Cost of Risk Avoidance ............................................. 596
       Vaughn v. Halifax-Dartmouth Bridge Comm. ................. 596
       Law Estate v. Simice .................................................... 597
       Notes and Questions .................................................... 598
   (c) Social Utility ......................................................... 600
       Watt v. Hertfordshire County Council ....................... 600
       Notes and Questions .................................................... 601

4. An Economic Analysis of the Standard of Care .................................................. 602
   United States v. Carroll Towing Co. ................................ 602
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 603

5. Special Standards of Care ............................................ 606
   (a) The Standard of Care Expected of the Disabled .... 606
       Fiala v. Cechmanek .................................................... 606
       Notes and Questions .................................................... 611
   (b) The Standard of Care Expected of Children .......... 613
       Joyal v. Barsby ............................................................ 613
       Notes and Questions .................................................... 615
   (c) The Standard of Care Expected of Professionals... 617
       White v. Turner ............................................................ 617
       Notes and Questions .................................................... 619

6. Degrees of Negligence .................................................. 625
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 626

7. Custom ........................................................................ 627
   ter Neuzen v. Korn ....................................................... 627
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 630
   Review Problems .......................................................... 633

CHAPTER 16 CAUSATION .......................................................... 635

1. Introduction .................................................................. 635

2. The But-For Test ........................................................... 636
   Kaufman v. Toronto Transit Commission ....................... 636
   Barnett v. Chelsea & Kensington Hospital
   Management Committee .............................................. 637
   Notes and Questions .................................................... 638

3. Established Exceptions to the But-For Test .................... 640
4. Recent Attempts to Modify the But-For Test ............... 643
   (a) Materially Increased Risk of Injury Test .................. 643
       Snell v. Farrell ................................................. 644
       Notes and Questions .......................................... 648
   (b) Material Contribution to Injury Test ....................... 652
       Notes and Questions .......................................... 653
       Clements v. Clements ........................................... 654
       Notes and Questions .......................................... 658
   (c) Proportionate Cause and Loss of Chance .................... 659
       Notes and Questions .......................................... 660
       Review Problem ................................................. 661

5. Multiple Causes ...................................................... 661
   Notes and Questions .............................................. 662
   (a) Independent Insufficient Causes .............................. 664
       Athey v. Leonati .................................................. 664
       Nowlan v. Brunswick Construction Ltee ........................ 667
       Notes and Questions .......................................... 667
   (b) Independent Sufficient Causes ................................ 669
       Lambton v. Mellish .............................................. 669
       Notes and Questions .......................................... 670
       Review Problems ................................................. 671

6. Issues in Assessing the Plaintiff's Loss ......................... 671
   (a) Successive Causes of Parallel Injury ......................... 671
       Penner v. Mitchell .............................................. 672
       Notes and Questions .......................................... 673
   (b) Devaluing the Plaintiff's Loss ................................ 674
       Dillon v. Twin State Gas and Elec. Co. ....................... 674
       Notes and Questions .......................................... 675
       Review Problems ................................................. 676

CHAPTER 17 REMOTENESS ............................................. 679
1. Introduction .......................................................... 679
2. Directness Versus Foreseeability .................................. 680
   (a) The Directness Test .......................................... 680
       Notes and Questions .......................................... 680
   (b) The Foreseeability Test ...................................... 681
       The Wagon Mound (No. 1); Overseas Tankship (U.K.) Ltd. v. Morts Dock & Engineering Co. ........................ 681
       Notes and Questions .......................................... 683
       Review Problems ................................................. 685
3. Modifications to the Foreseeability Test ......................... 685
   (a) The Kind of Injury .............................................. 685
       Hughes v. Lord Advocate ...................................... 685
       Notes and Questions .......................................... 687
   (b) The Thin-Skulled Plaintiff Rule .............................. 689
CHAPTER 18 THE ASSESSMENT OF DAMAGES ........................................... 721

1. Introduction ................................................................. 721
   (a) The Purposes of Damage Awards in Negligence ... 721
       Notes and Questions........................................... 722
   (b) The Existence of Damage ........................................... 724
       Notes and Questions........................................... 725
   (c) Preliminary Issues.................................................. 726
       Notes and Questions........................................... 727

2. Damages for Personal Injuries ........................................... 731
   (a) Introduction .......................................................... 731
       Andrews v. Grand & Toy Alberta Ltd. ......................... 732
       Notes and Questions........................................... 733
   (b) Pecuniary Loss: Future Care....................................... 736
       Andrews v. Grand & Toy Alberta Ltd. ......................... 736
       Notes and Questions........................................... 740
   (c) Pecuniary Loss: Lost Earning Capacity............... 743
       Andrews v. Grand & Toy Alberta Ltd. ......................... 743
       Notes and Questions........................................... 744
   (d) Considerations Relevant to Both Heads of Pecuniary Loss .......... 749
       Andrews v. Grand & Toy Alberta Ltd. ......................... 749
       Notes and Questions........................................... 751
   (e) Non-Pecuniary Loss ................................................ 752
       Andrews v. Grand & Toy Alberta Ltd. ......................... 752
       Notes and Questions........................................... 754
(f) Other Categories of Loss ........................................... 757

3. Survival of Actions and Dependents’ Claims ................. 758
   (a) Survival of Actions ........................................... 758
       Survival of Actions Act (Alberta) ...................... 758
       Trustee Act (Ontario) ........................................... 759
   (b) Fatal Accidents Legislation ................................ 759
       Fatal Injuries Act (Nova Scotia) ......................... 760
       Family Law Act (Ontario) .................................... 761
   Notes and Questions ........................................... 761
       (i) The Death of the Family Provider .................... 763
           Keizer v. Hanna ............................................ 763
           Notes and Questions .................................... 767
       (ii) The Death of a Dependant Family Member ....... 768
           Notes and Questions .................................... 768

4. Damages for Property Loss ........................................ 770
   (a) The Assessment of the Damage to the Property
       Itself ..................................................................... 770
   (b) The Assessment of Economic Losses Consequent
       on the Damage to the Property ............................. 771
   (c) The Plaintiff’s Obligation to Mitigate .................. 772
       Notes and Questions ........................................... 772

5. Collateral Benefits ................................................... 775
   (a) The Doctrine of Subrogation ............................... 777
       Notes and Questions ........................................... 777
   Review Problems ................................................ 779

CHAPTER 19 DEFENCES IN NEGLIGENCE ............................ 783

1. Introduction .......................................................... 783

2. Contributory Negligence ......................................... 783
   (a) The Development of the Defence ......................... 783
       Notes and Questions ........................................... 784
   (b) Conduct Constituting Contributory Negligence ....... 785
       Walls v. Mussens Ltd. ........................................... 785
       Notes and Questions ........................................... 787
       Gagnon v. Beaulieu ............................................. 790
       Notes and Questions ........................................... 793
   (c) Apportionment of Loss ...................................... 794
       Negligence Act (Ontario) .................................... 794
       Notes and Questions ........................................... 795
       Mortimer v. Cameron .......................................... 798
       Notes and Questions ........................................... 801
       Review Problem ................................................. 803

3. Voluntary Assumption of Risk ................................. 803
   Dubre v. Labar ...................................................... 804
   Notes and Questions ........................................... 807

4. Participation in a Criminal or Immoral Act ................ 810
   Hall v. Hebert ...................................................... 810
   Notes and Questions ........................................... 814

5. Inevitable Accident ................................................ 817
CHAPTER 20  PROOF OF NEGLIGENCE ................................................................. 821
1. The Burden of Proof in a Negligence Action ...................................... 821
   Wakelin v. London & South Western Ry. Co. ........................................ 822
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 825
2. Exceptions to the General Principles Governing the Burden of Proof ........ 827
   (a) Statutes and Shifting Burdens of Proof .................................... 827
   MacDonald v. Woodard ............................................................... 827
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 828
   (b) Directly Caused Injury: Unintended Trespass .......................... 829
   Dahlberg v. Naydiuk .................................................................... 829
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 831
   (c) Multiple Negligent Defendants .............................................. 831
   Cook v. Lewis ............................................................................. 831
   Clements v. Clements ................................................................... 833
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 834
3. Res Ipsa Loquitur ............................................................................. 840
   Fontaine v. British Columbia (Official Administrator) ...................... 841
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 844
   Review Problems ................................................................. 846

CHAPTER 21  THE TORT LIABILITY OF PUBLIC AUTHORITIES ... 847
1. Introduction .................................................................................. 847
2. Special Rules for Public Authorities ................................................ 848
   (a) Legislative and Judicial Functions ............................................ 848
   Bradley v. Fisher ......................................................................... 849
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 850
   (b) Crown Immunity ................................................................. 854
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 854
   (c) Limitation Periods and Special Procedures ................................ 857
   Notes ......................................................................................... 857
3. The Negligence Liability of Public Authorities .................................. 858
   (a) Introduction ......................................................................... 858
   Just v. British Columbia ............................................................. 859
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 866
   (b) The Effect of Cooper v. Hobart .............................................. 869
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 871
   R. v. Imperial Tobacco Canada Ltd .............................................. 872
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 876
4. Misfeasance in a Public Office ......................................................... 877
   (a) Introduction ......................................................................... 877
   Roncarelli v. Duplessis .................................................................. 877
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 879
   (b) Modern Developments .......................................................... 880
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

*Odhavji Estate v. Woodhouse* ........................................ 880
Notes and Questions .................................................... 887

5. **Other Torts** .......................................................... 889
Notes and Questions .................................................... 890
Review Problems ......................................................... 891

**CHAPTER 22**  
**STATUTORY PROVISIONS AND TORT LIABILITY** ................................................................. 893

1. **Introduction** .......................................................... 893
Note ............................................................................. 894

2. **Express Statutory Causes of Action**  
   *Trespass to Property Act* (Ontario) ................................ 894
   *Competition Act* (Canada) ........................................... 895
Notes and Questions .................................................... 896

   *Trachsler v. Halton* ...................................................... 896
Notes and Questions .................................................... 897
Review Problem ........................................................... 899

3. **The Use of Statutes in Common Law Negligence**  
   *R. in Right of Can. v. Sask. Wheat Pool* ....................... 901
Notes and Questions .................................................... 907
   (a) Breach of Statutory Duty and Common Law  
       *Standard of Care* .................................................. 912
       *Ryan v. Victoria (City)* ........................................... 912
       *Marshall v. Annapolis County School Board* .............. 915
Notes and Questions .................................................... 917

4. **A Note on the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms**  
   *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms* .................... 918
Notes............................................................................... 921

   *Vancouver (City) v. Ward* ........................................... 923
Notes and Questions .................................................... 927
Review Problems ........................................................... 930

**CHAPTER 23**  
**OCCUPIERS’ LIABILITY** ......................................................... 931

1. **Introduction** .......................................................... 931

2. **The Common Law Principles of Occupiers’ Liability**  
   (a) Who is an Occupier? ................................................... 933
       *Palmer v. St. John* .................................................. 933
Notes and Questions .................................................... 935
   (b) Categories of Entrants and Corresponding Duties ........ 936
      (i) Contractual Entrants ............................................. 936
      *Finigan v. Calgary* .................................................. 936
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 938
      (ii) Invitees and Licensees ........................................ 939
      *McErlean v. Sarel* .................................................. 939
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 942
      (iii) Trespassers ....................................................... 944
      *Veinot v. Kerr-Addison Mines Ltd.* ........................... 944
3. The Provincial Occupiers’ Liability Statutes .......... 948
   (a) Introduction .................................................... 948
   (b) Ontario Occupiers’ Liability Act ...................... 949
       Occupiers’ Liability Act (Ontario) ..................... 949
       Notes and Questions ....................................... 952
       Waldick v. Malcolm .......................................... 960
       Notes and Questions ....................................... 964
       Review Problem ............................................. 964

CHAPTER 24 NUISANCE ........................................... 967
1. Introduction ..................................................... 967
   Note ................................................................. 968
2. Private Nuisance .............................................. 968
   340909 Ont. Ltd. v. Huron Steel Products (Windsor) Ltd. .... 968
   Notes and Questions ......................................... 972
   Antrim Truck Centre Ltd. v. Ontario (Transportation) .......... 977
   Notes and Questions ......................................... 982
   Hollywood Silver Fox Farm Ltd. v. Emmett ..................... 983
   Notes and Questions ......................................... 985
   (a) Defence of Statutory Authority ......................... 986
   Tock v. St. John’s Metropolitan Area Board .................... 986
   Notes and Questions ......................................... 990
3. Public Nuisance ............................................... 994
   A.-G. Ont. v. Orange Productions Ltd. ....................... 995
   Hickey v. Electricity Reduction Co. .......................... 997
   Notes and Questions ......................................... 999
4. Remedies ......................................................... 1002
   Mendez v. Palazzi ............................................... 1002
   Notes and Questions ......................................... 1004
   Miller v. Jackson ............................................... 1005
   Notes and Questions ......................................... 1010
   Spur Industries Inc. v. Del E. Webb Development Co. .......... 1011
   Notes and Questions ......................................... 1013
   Review Problem ............................................... 1017

CHAPTER 25 STRICT AND VICARIOUS LIABILITY .......... 1019
1. Introduction ..................................................... 1019
   (a) Strict Liability ............................................... 1019
   (b) Vicarious Liability .......................................... 1020
       Notes and Questions ..................................... 1020
2. Strict Liability for Escape of Dangerous Substances:
   Rylands v. Fletcher ........................................... 1021
      (a) Introduction .............................................. 1021
   Rylands v. Fletcher ........................................... 1021
       Notes and Questions ..................................... 1023
Notes and Questions................................. 1104
4. **Intimidation** ........................................... 1109
   *Central Can. Potash v. Govt. of Sask* ................. 1110
   Notes and Questions.................................. 1112
5. **Conspiracy** ........................................... 1114
   *Posluns v. Toronto Stock Exchange* ................. 1115
   Notes and Questions.................................. 1116
6. **Interference with Contractual Relations** ........ 1124
   *Lumley v. Gye*......................................... 1125
   Notes and Questions.................................. 1127
7. **The Unlawful Means Tort** ............................ 1133
   *A.I. Enterprises Ltd. v. Bram Enterprises Ltd.* .... 1134
   Notes and Questions.................................. 1141
   Review Problem....................................... 1145

CHAPTER 27  **DEFAMATION**................................. 1147
1. **Introduction** ......................................... 1147
   Notes and Questions.................................. 1148
2. **Elements of a Defamation Action** .................. 1151
   (a) Defamatory Material ................................ 1151
       *Sim v. Stretch*....................................... 1152
       Notes and Questions................................ 1154
   (b) Reference to the Plaintiff ......................... 1158
       *Knuppfer v. London Express Newspaper, Ltd.* .. 1158
       Notes and Questions................................ 1159
   (c) Publication ........................................... 1160
       Notes and Questions................................ 1161
3. **Defences** .............................................. 1164
   (a) Justification ........................................ 1164
       *Williams v. Reason*.................................. 1165
       Notes and Questions................................ 1167
   (b) Absolute Privilege .................................. 1168
       (i) Executive Officers ....................... 1169
           *Dowson v. The Queen*......................... 1169
       (ii) Parliamentary Privilege .................. 1172
       (iii) Judicial Proceedings ...................... 1172
           *Hung v. Gardiner*...... 1172
           Notes and Questions............................ 1176
   (c) Qualified Privilege ................................ 1178
       *Hill v. Church of Scientology* .................. 1180
       Notes and Questions................................ 1184
   (d) Fair Comment ........................................ 1185
       *WIC Radio Ltd. v. Simpson*................. 1186
       Notes and Questions................................ 1195
   (e) Responsible Communication on Matters of
       Public Interest ........................................ 1198
       *Grant v. Torstar Corp.* ......................... 1199
       Notes and Questions................................ 1208
   (f) Consent .............................................. 1209
4. Remedies .......................................................... 1212
   (a) Injunction ...................................................... 1212
   (b) Damages ........................................................ 1213

Hill v. Church of Scientology ...................................... 1213
Notes and Questions .................................................. 1222
Review Question ......................................................... 1223

CHAPTER 28 TORT LAW: THEORIES, CRITICISMS AND
ALTERNATIVES ........................................................... 1225

1. Introduction ........................................................... 1225

2. Theoretical Criticism of Tort Law .................................. 1225
   (a) Introduction ...................................................... 1225
   Notes ................................................................. 1226
   (b) Deterrence ......................................................... 1226
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 1228
   (c) Compensation ................................................... 1230
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 1232
   (d) Theories of Tort Law Based on Concepts of
       Justice .............................................................. 1233
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 1236
   (e) Feminist Perspectives .......................................... 1240
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 1241

3. The No-Fault Alternatives ........................................ 1243
   (a) Introduction ...................................................... 1243
   (b) No-Fault Accident Compensation in New
       Zealand ........................................................... 1244
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 1245
   (c) Workers’ Compensation ...................................... 1248
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 1248
   (d) No-Fault Automobile Insurance in Canada ........... 1249
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 1250
Review Problem ......................................................... 1253