# Table of Contents

*Preface.* ................................................................. v

*List of Contributors* ...................................................... ix

**Chapter 1 The Evolution and Jurisprudence of Canadian Environmental Law**  
*Alastair R. Lucas and William A. Tilleman*

1. Introduction. .......................................................... 1
2. The Early Cases. ...................................................... 2
3. Environmental Law in the Supreme Court of Canada .......... 3
4. Environmental Assessment. ......................................... 4
5. Aboriginal Law and Environment ................................. 5
6. Environmental Cases and Policy Development ................. 7  
   (a) Public Inquiries .................................................. 7
7. Environmental Appeal Tribunals ................................... 8
8. Public Participation and Involvement ............................ 9  
   (a) Standing ............................................................ 9
   (b) North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation . 9
   (c) Private Prosecutions ............................................. 10
   (d) Environmental Bills of Rights ................................ 10
9. Spaces and Species Protection .................................... 11
10. Public Trust .......................................................... 12
11. Climate Change ..................................................... 15
12. The Chapters ......................................................... 16

**PART I: INTERNATIONAL AND CONSTITUTIONAL LAW – PUBLIC INQUIRIES**

**Chapter 2 Promoting Precaution: The Hudson (Spraytech) Case at the Supreme Court of Canada**  
*Jerry V. DeMarco*

1. Case and Context. ..................................................... 27
2. Intervention. .......................................................... 28
3. The Precautionary Principle. ....................................... 31
4. The Supreme Court Decision – Intervention Impact ........... 32
5. The Influence of International Law ................................. 34
6. Conclusion. ............................................................ 36
Chapter 3  Nuclear Liability Act Challenge: Energy Probe v. Canada
(Attorney General)
Theresa McClenaghan with input from David Poch
1. Origins and Impetus of the Case ............................. 39
2. Legal Theory and What Clients and Counsel
   Hoped to Come of it ........................................... 41
3. Interim Proceedings ........................................... 42
4. Standing ...................................................... 44
5. Reasonable Cause of Action ................................. 46
6. Action ....................................................... 48
7. Section 7 .................................................... 50
8. Section 15 .................................................... 53
9. Canadian Bill of Rights ........................................ 53
10. Costs ....................................................... 54
11. Appeal ..................................................... 55
12. Conclusion; Resolution? ..................................... 56

Chapter 4  Citizen Complaints to the North American Commission for
Environmental Cooperation
Katia Opalka
1. Introduction ................................................... 60
2. The Kathryn Spirit ........................................... 60
3. Politics and Environmental Protection ..................... 61
4. Manure ......................................................... 63
5. Lead .......................................................... 64
6. Acid Mine Drainage .......................................... 65
7. Vehicle Exhaust .............................................. 66
8. PCBs .......................................................... 66
9. Conclusion ...................................................... 67

Chapter 5  The Berger Inquiry and the Committee for Justice and Liberty
Case
Alastair R. Lucas
1. Introduction ................................................... 69
2. Chapter Scope and Theory – The Inquiry’s Legal Legacy ...... 72
3. Preamble to the Inquiry ....................................... 73
4. Preliminary Hearings and Rulings ............................ 75
5. The Hearings ................................................... 77
6. Key Inquiry Recommendations ............................. 78
7. The Inquiry’s Environmental Law Legacy .................... 79
   (a) Public Participation – Standing and Intervenor Funding ... 79
   (b) Environmental Assessment ................................ 81
   (c) Environmental Protection and Conservation............... 82
Chapter 6  Tragedy on Tap: Representing Concerned Walkerton Citizens at the Walkerton Inquiry

Theresa McClenaghan, Paul Muldoon, Rick Lindgren, Ramani Nadarajah and Fe de Leon

1. Origins of the Case: Crisis ......................................................... 91
2. Canadian Environmental Law Association’s (CELA) Involvement ......................... 91
3. Concerned Walkerton Citizens ........................................................................ 93
4. Inquiry Launched ......................................................................................... 94
5. CELA Team Participation in the Inquiry ......................................................... 95
6. Key Issues for CELA’s Clients, the Concerned Walkerton Citizens ................. 96
8. Results of Part 1 of the Walkerton Inquiry ................................................... 101
9. Part 2 ................................................................................................. 103
10. Law Reform Following the Inquiry ................................................................ 105
11. Conclusion ................................................................................................. 107

PART II:  INDIGENOUS RIGHTS

Chapter 7  Haida Nation – The Origins of the Haida Litigation

Greg McDade
1. Background ................................................................................................. 111
2. The Haida Petition ..................................................................................... 113
3. The Original Petition .................................................................................. 115
4. The Second Petition .................................................................................... 117
5. The Aftermath Post-Haida ......................................................................... 121

Chapter 8  Tsilhqot’in Nation: A Territorial Land-Use Concept of Aboriginal Title and Environmental Governance

Nicole Schabus
1. Introduction ................................................................................................. 127
2. History of the Case .................................................................................... 129
3. Use-based Territorial Approach ................................................................. 132
4. Underlying Issues ...................................................................................... 138
5. Justification of Infringement .................................................................... 144
6. Conclusion ................................................................................................. 147
PART III: ENVIRONMENTAL REGULATION

Chapter 9 Leave to Appeal Under Ontario’s Environmental Bill of Rights: Lafarge Canada Inc. v. Ontario (Environmental Review Tribunal)

Joseph F. Castrilli and Richard D. Lindgren

1. Introduction. 151
2. Background to the Development of the Environmental Bill of Rights. 153
4. The Development of Environmental Review Tribunal Jurisprudence on Leave to Appeal Applications. 155
5. The Lafarge Alternative Fuels Project, Ministry of the Environment Approvals, and the Leave to Appeal Applications. 157
6. The Tribunal Decision: Dawber v. Ontario (Director, Ministry of the Environment). 159
7. The Divisional Court Decision: Lafarge Canada Inc. v. Ontario (Environmental Review Tribunal). 161
8. Impact of Lafarge on Environmental Decision-Making in Ontario. 164
9. Conclusions. 171

Chapter 10 Protecting and Expanding the Scope of Environmental Legislation: Castonguay Blasting Ltd. v. Ontario (Environment)

Joseph F. Castrilli and Ramani Nadarajah

1. Introduction. 173
2. Background. 175
   (a) The Facts. 175
   (b) The Charge. 176
   (c) The Issue. 177
3. Arguments Before the Courts. 177
   (a) Appellant company. 177
   (b) Respondent Crown. 178
4. Judicial History of the Case. 178
   (a) Ontario Court of Justice. 178
   (b) Superior Court. 178
   (c) Ontario Court of Appeal. 179
      (i) The majority holding. 179
      (ii) The dissent. 179
5. Supreme Court of Canada – Decision and Reasons of the Court. 180
TABLE OF CONTENTS

(a) Overview: When in Doubt, Report .......................... 180
(b) Parsing the Section 15 Reporting Requirement  .......... 181
(c) Discharge of Contaminant ...................................... 181
(d) Discharge into Natural Environment ......................... 182
(e) Discharge Out of the Normal Course of Events .......... 182
(f) Discharge Causing or Likely to Cause An Adverse Effect .. 182
(g) Interpretation Based on the Precautionary Principle .... 184
(h) Summary .......................................................... 185
6. Analysis: Not Just Another Rock Blasting Case .......... 186
7. Impact of Castonguay ............................................. 188
8. Conclusions ......................................................... 189

Chapter 11 The Alberta Disadvantage on Public Participation:
Martha Kostuch v. Ken Kowalski

Shaun Fluker
1. Introduction .......................................................... 191
2. The Prelude: Oldman River Dam ................................. 194
3. The Cement Plant .................................................... 199
4. The Aftermath ......................................................... 210

Chapter 12 The Ekati Story – Canada’s First Diamond Mine

David H. Searle
1. The Diamond Discovery ............................................. 215
2. Environmental Assessment ......................................... 217
3. Impact and Benefit Agreements ................................... 219
4. Approvals ............................................................. 220
5. Outcomes and Comment ............................................. 221

PART IV: ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT

Chapter 13 Friends of the Oldman River: The Veterinarian, the
Environment, and the Constitution

Judith B. Hanebury, Q.C.
1. Introduction .......................................................... 227
2. The Road to a Federal Role in Environmental Impact
   Assessment .......................................................... 228
3. The Development of Opposition to the Oldman River Dam ..... 231
4. Friends of the Oldman River at the Federal Court .......... 233
5. The Federal Court of Appeal Decision and its Aftermath .... 234
6. The Appeal to the Supreme Court of Canada ................. 237
(a) The Constitutional Question .................................... 238
   (i) Policy aspects of the constitutional question .......... 238
   (ii) Legal aspects of the constitutional question .......... 240

TABLE OF CONTENTS xix
(b) The Hearing .............................................. 242
7. The Supreme Court of Canada Decision .................. 243
   (a) The Assessment Trigger .......................... 245
   (b) Scope of the Project .............................. 245
   (c) Factors to be Assessed .......................... 246
   (d) Mitigation Measures ............................. 247
   (e) Conclusion on the Constitutional Question ...... 247
8. The Panel Report Under EARPGO ....................... 248
9. Epilogue ................................................ 249

Chapter 14  The Project Scoping Fights: Revisiting the Cases in
Sunpine, TrueNorth and MiningWatch
Martin Ignasiak and Jackie Johnson
1. Introduction .......................................... 253
2. The Legal Framework under CEAA ................. 254
3. The Project Scoping Fights .......................... 256
4. The Aftermath ......................................... 264

Chapter 15  Reconsidering Red Chris: Federal Environmental
Decision-Making After MiningWatch Canada v. Canada (Fisheries and Oceans)
Martin Z. Olszynski
1. Introduction .......................................... 267
2. Analysis ................................................ 271
   (a) Decision-Making vs Legislating ............... 271
   (b) Deconstructing Federal Cost-Benefit Analysis .. 273
   (c) Federal Decision-making in the Public Interest .. 278
3. Conclusion ............................................ 282

Chapter 16  Nothing (Significant) to See Here: The Kearl Cases
and the Growing Mess in the Alberta Oil Sands
Sean Nixon and Melissa Gorrie
1. Introduction .......................................... 283
2. The Kearl Project and Oil Sands Mining Generally .. 284
3. The Environmental Assessment of the Kearl Project .. 285
   (a) Cumulative Landscape Effects of Oil Sands Development .. 286
   (b) Assessing Effects on Species at Risk ............. 287
   (c) Greenhouse Gases and Climate Change .......... 288
   (d) Panel Report ..................................... 289
4. The First Kearl Case .................................. 291
   (a) Cumulative Landscape Effects .................. 295
      (i) Assessing Effects on Species at Risk .......... 297
   (b) Effects of the Project’s Greenhouse Gas Emissions .. 297
PART V: SPACES AND SPECIES PROTECTION

Chapter 17 Ecological Integrity in Canada’s National Parks

William A. Tilleman

1. Introduction. 317
2. Ecological Integrity Legislation. 318
3. Case Law Interpreting Ecological Integrity as “First Priority”. 320
4. Parks Canada Development Policy: Commercial and Residential Leaseholders. 322
5. Indigenous Peoples: From Exclusion to Partnership. 326

Chapter 18 Legal Efforts to Protect Species at Risk in Canada: A Case Study of the Greater Sage-Grouse

Devon Page and Melissa Gorrie

1. The Federal Species at Risk Act: Assessing Opportunities For Protection. 329
2. Taking Action to Protect Species at Risk: Early Litigation Under SARA. 331
3. The Poster Child: Sage-Grouse. 333
   (a) Going to Court to Protect the Sage-Grouse: Round 1. 334
   (b) Setting the Stage for Round 2: The Need For Further Action to Protect the Sage-Grouse. 336
   (c) Going to Court to Protect the Sage-Grouse: Round 2. 338
   (d) Challenging the Government’s Claim of Cabinet Confidence. 339
   (e) Success at the Federal Court of Appeal. 341
   (f) Establishing Important Precedents. 342
   (g) New Challenges for Sage-Grouse. 343
4. Looking Forward: Incremental Victories. 344
5. Conclusion. 344
## PART VI: ENFORCEMENT

### Chapter 19 The Syncrude “Ducks” Trial: How Interagency Cooperation Helped Solve the Problem of the “Mega File”

*Susan McRory and Tim McRory*

1. Introduction. ................................................. 347
2. History ......................................................... 349
   (a) First Suncor Prosecutions ................................ 349
   (b) The Western Co-operative Fertilizers Incident ........ 351
   (c) 1995 ....................................................... 353
   (d) Wabumun 2005 .............................................. 354
3. 2008 – Syncrude ............................................. 356
4. The Creative Sentencing Projects from the Syncrude File .... 361
5. Closing Thoughts ............................................ 363

### Chapter 20 The Suncor Saga: Transforming Alberta Environmental Law Enforcement

*David Estrin*

1. Introduction .................................................. 365
2. Saga Highlights ............................................. 366
3. The Suncor Saga in Context: Alberta Environment’s First 18 Years: “Work with industry ... settle our differences through technical discussions” ......................... 370
4. Beginnings of the Suncor Saga ............................. 374
5. My Introduction to the Suncor Saga ......................... 378
6. The Suncor Trials, Part 1: October, 1982 *Clean Water Act* Charges for Excessive Contaminant Discharges Dismissed; and Start of *Fisheries Act* Trial ........................................ 380
8. The Suncor Sentence and its Aftermath .................... 386
9. Why did Suncor Become a *Cause Célèbre*? ............... 389
12. Further Progress 1991-2016 ................................. 415
14. Concluding Reflections ........................................ 429